

# The Gazette

## Montreal police come up short in crime-busting The city has most cops per population but the force ranks 7th in results

By HENRY AUBIN, The Gazette  
December 18, 2010

How sharp is Montreal Island's police department at solving crimes? And how responsible is it in spending taxpayers' money?

Fresh evidence sheds troubling light on these questions.

A study published by Statistics Canada on Thursday compares Canadian cities' police forces' "weighted clearance rates" for crimes. A clearance is cop jargon for formally charging a suspect (or being unable to lay a charge because the suspect cannot be found or has died). StatsCan assigns a weight to each crime according to its severity, so that a murder gets a higher weight than a theft.

The study shows that Montreal's rate in 2009 ranks No. 8 among Canada's 10 largest cities. Only Vancouver and, in last place, Quebec City, fare worse.

What makes this ranking all the more dismal is the study also shows that Montreal police at the end of 2009 had more officers per 100,000 population than did any other major city. We have the dubious distinction of being manpower champs.

Another recent report, this one focused exclusively on homicides, appears to be consistent with StatsCan's finding that the department is subpar at sleuthing. This other report, the subject of a column two weeks ago, shows that police across Quebec have a lower clearance rate for homicides than their counterparts in any of Canada's five regions during the period under study, 1991-2006.

This report, by Tanya Trussler, a professor of justice studies at Mount Royal University in Calgary, does not examine the rates for individual cities. However, about 40 per cent of Quebec's homicides occur on Montreal Island in a typical year, so draw your own conclusions.

So much for the Montreal's police department's performance in protecting the public. Let's look now at its performance in spending your money.

The department's spending in 2011, according to the agglomeration budget approved yesterday, will be 5.1 per cent higher than last year's spending. That's well above the 3.2 per cent rise in inflation that the Conference Board of Canada predicts for the Montreal area in the new year. And this large increase is part of a trend. Since 2006, the department's spending has increased by 28 per cent -triple the inflation rate. Spending increase have thus averaged 6.9 per cent a year during this stretch.

**At first glance, it might appear as though the department is reining in its finances somewhat. After all, a 5.1-percent hike is lower than 6.9 per cent. But that improvement is illusory, says William Steinberg, Hampstead's mayor. He points out that the department has failed to bring in the revenue that it had anticipated in the 2010 budget (partly because the commercialization of its services has been disappointing). The net increase in burden to the island's taxpayers in the new year, he calculates, will therefore really be eight per cent.**

The past year has providing some jolting insights into how the police department is policing its own spending. As The Gazette revealed last month, the department planned a modernization of its computer system in 2001 for \$1.65 million, and the latest cost estimate for the unfinished task is \$20 million. As well, several years ago the department handed a financially troubled security company, BCIA, a generous contract for guarding police headquarters without calling for tenders or obtaining city council's approval.

The public-security committee, the political body that oversees the police and that is headed by Verdun Mayor Claude Trudel, said in a report yesterday the island's politicians should ask the province for more money for police, thereby easing the fiscal load on the island's taxpayers. Never mind that Quebec is already over its head in debt.

**In a**

# Public Security Commission Minority Report

Prepared by William Steinberg, Mayor Town of Hampstead

WHEREAS spending by the SPVM from 2006 to 2010 has climbed at over 3 times the rate of inflation. Expenses in 2006 were \$476,138,000; by 2010 expenses had climbed to \$607,900,000, an increase of 27.7%.

WHEREAS the net budget increase in 2011 is 8%, more than double the expected inflation rate.

WHEREAS the SPVM budgets have been exceeded each year, for the past four years, by an average amount of 6.5%.

WHEREAS there is new senior management at the SPVM and it is hoped that the poor budget performance of the past four years can be significantly improved under this new management team.

WHEREAS it is too late to reasonably reject the 2011 budget

**R.1 It is recommended that the SPVM budget of 2011 be accepted, provided that the draft budget for 2012 be presented to this commission no later than September 1, 2011; that monthly reports be given to this commission, showing actual spending and revenues compared to budget projections, starting in February; and that the SPVM commit to taking all necessary steps to not exceed the 2011 budget.**

WHEREAS Montreal has more police officers per 100,000 residents (241) than Toronto (212) and yet our major crime solution rate is lower.

WHEREAS according to the most recent annual Statistics Canada report, Montreal has the second worst solution rate of the 10 largest cities in Canada, just barely better than Vancouver.

WHEREAS Montreal's police cost per 100,000 residents is \$315 while it is \$348 in Toronto. However the cost of living in Toronto is 30% higher than in Montreal. Making the adjustment for this difference, the Montreal cost becomes \$409.50 which is 18% higher than the cost in Toronto.

WHEREAS the SPVM state that they provide more services than the Toronto police and that the crime solution statistics are misleading.

WHEREAS this commission cannot evaluate the performance of the SPVM relative to the cost, nor the reasonableness of its budgets, without knowing how the SPVM compares to Toronto and other large Canadian cities.

WHEREAS if it is true that the SPVM does more than the Toronto police, this commission should be able to examine the extra activities, relative to cost, and determine if these activities are justified and whether each activity is a good use of limited resources.

**R.2 It is recommended that the SPVM provide a report showing the services rendered by the SPVM as compared to those provided in Toronto along with the comparative costs of each activity for both cities.**

**R.3 It is recommended that the SPVM provide reports comparing Montreal crime solution rates to other, large, Canadian cities.**

WHEREAS the main force driving up policing costs is salaries and generous pension plan benefits.

WHEREAS the rules governing the pension plans can not be changed by the SPVM management.

**R.4 It is recommended that Montreal ask the Quebec government to help find solutions to these problems as Montreal drives the Quebec economy and Agglomeration property taxpayers have limited means to pay constant increases in policing costs well above the rate of inflation.**